

GEOMATICS 4008
ADVANCED TOPICS IN GEOGRAPHIC INFORMATION SYSTEMS
Fall 2012

LAB 1: Article Critique

Due: September 24, in lab period.

Objective: To introduce you to the scientific literature and to encourage critical evaluation of others' work.

Select a research article from a GIS journal or conference proceedings (not ARCNews or other vendor magazines). If you select a conference proceedings article, make sure it is not just a short summary – it should be at least 5-6 pages of text. The topic of the article must fit within one of the topics of this course. Choose an article with some experimentation / empirical study - do not select a review article of methods in a given application. Verify with me by e-mail if you're unsure whether the article is suitable.

Write a 2.5-3 page (1.5 line spacing, margins 1.0", minimum 11 point font) critique of the article that includes the following:

- what the article is about (the topic, problem being addressed, why it is important)
- objective(s) of the study
- the approach and/or methodology
- significant results obtained
- conclusions
- your assessment of the article: e.g., Were the objectives properly (clearly) stated? Were they well addressed? Were the methods explained, and did they suit the problem? Were results adequate? Were conclusions appropriate or overstated? Do you think the research contributes significantly to the advancement of GIS? Could the author(s) have done more (or less)? etc. Give your view on the significance of the work and the article. Your assessment in this section is the most important aspect of the critique.

Hand in a photocopy or printout of the article with your review.

Example sources: International Journal of Geographical Information Science, Transactions in GIS, Geomatica, Photogrammetric Engineering and Remote Sensing Special GIS issues, applications journals in your field which may include GIS articles (e.g., Ecology, Epidemiology, Demographics, etc.), geomatics conferences (many proceedings in the library).

5% of course mark as follows: Summary of topic (0.5); Objectives (0.5); Methods (1); Results (1); Your assessment of the work (2). Up to 1.0 will be deducted for poor grammar, spelling and flow.